

## Cumrae Ferry Users Group

Meeting Date / Place : Tuesday 5th April 2022 : Field Studies Centre, Cumrae : Arc Room

Attendees
Angus Campbell (CFU commuter & Calmac Community Board); Tommy Gore (Calmac Operations Manager); Cllr Ian Murdoch; Duncan Fraser(CCC/ FSC); Iain Morrison (Millport Motors); ; Gail Murphy (Business rep); Cllr Alan Hill; Lisa Christie (CCC); Jonathan Rimmer, Research & Media Assistant for Katy Clark MSP; Robbie Drummond, Managing Director, CalMac Ferries Ltd; Scott Ferris (IOCTA), Debra Ferris (CCDC); Elke Scheibler (Manager Field Studies Council)
Apologies
Tracey Price (FSC); Kenneth Gibson (MSP); Crawford Gillan (MRG); Carol Ann Baxter (CalMac Largs Port Manager); Kari Lundie (CFU Chair); Alan Comrie (SPT); Cllr Tom Marshall; Katy Clark (MSP); Alex Morton (Business Rep); Chris Sutherland, Commuter
Welcome
Robbie Drummond, Managing Director, CalMac Ferries Ltd

Issue / Agenda Item	Status	Action / Comment
CMAL - Cumrae Slipway redevelopment	Open	<p>CMAL presented options for the redevelopment of the Cumrae Slip way ( Presentation attached separately). It was confirmed that no other sites had been considered in these plans as CMAL own the current slipway and only like for like has been considered. Questions/Suggestions from the group as follows, which CMAL will respond to in due course.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Extending the length of the slipway to help alleviate tidal disruption</li> <li>- Sea defences to make slipway more weather resilient and reduce disruption</li> <li>- Investigation of other sites ( e.g. White bay) offering more shelter and reducing disruption</li> <li>- Could temporary slip way be kept as a back up, alternative option during certain weather conditions</li> </ul> <p><b>Action : CMAL to develop an alternative plan to improve weather resilience than a "like for like" replacement. Given these plans are to provide a slipway for the next 60yrs, the community do not believe that is appropriate to continue with a design that doesn't improve weather resilience.</b></p> <p><b>Action : CMAL to consult Calmac to ensure that the limiting weather features for the route are properly considered, with input from the Marine Staff, to ensure that the designs for replacement vessels and slipways that improve weather resilience are in place to improve on the current level of weather disruption</b></p> <p>Cost of redevelopment advised as circa £4.5m . Current timescale for temporary slipway Aug 2023 subject to approvals, funding etc. It was also suggested given the flood defence project would require a temp slipway that perhaps CMAL could liaise with the relevant teams.</p>
New Cumrae Ferry to Replace the Loch Riddon.	Open	<p>Tommy Gore confirmed that he has been involved in pushing the Loch Riddon up the priority list with CMAL for replacement. It is understood it will likely be 2025 before any new vessel appears. Discussion over whether this would provide a more weather resilient service ?</p> <p><b>Action : Tommy Gore to review with CMAL and the masters, further enhancements in design to make the new vessels / slipways more weather resilient</b></p>
Breakdown Analysis since Shira overhaul	Closed	<p>Alex Cross advised of 5 technical faults since the Shira came out of overhaul in January, leading to disruption on the route.</p> <p>Two issues with Generators (all separate defects); 1 maintenance access hatch hadn't been secured properly leading to water ingress; an issue with the sewage treatment plant and the latest being seaweed/rope debris caught up in the seal of the Voith unit damaging the seals and causing an oil leak.</p> <p>Loch shira expected back in service by Saturday 12th March.</p> <p>Alex advised Root Causes Analysis is carried out on each incident and to identify any trends in the defects to aid vessel reliability data.</p> <p><b>Action: Calmac to send summary of the technical defects</b></p>

Issue / Agenda Item	Status	Action / Comment
Robbie Drummond Key Messages	Noted	<p>Robbie confirmed that the ferry network was a very challenging environment currently, with</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•An aging fleet with no new vessels imminently , and a higher that desired breakdown level due to the age of the fleet and the multiple different systems and parts as the fleet are all built to different specs / equipment</li> <li>•New vessels are planned 801/802 and 2 new Islay vessels plus 7 new small vessels, including Largs – Cumbrae. It will be several years before they can be brought into service and make a difference</li> <li>•A fully deployed fleet with no spare vessels</li> <li>•Changing weather conditions making it harder to operate</li> <li>•Tighter Marine safety expectations than historically, and a lot of legal responsibility and pressure on the master</li> <li>•Ongoing work with CMAL looking around the world for suitable vessels to buy or lease</li> </ul>
Disruptions and Maintenance of Fleet	Noted	<p>Robbie Drummond confirmed that Calmacs maintenance budget has increased from £20m pa to over £30m pa, and that they continued to look at stock to ensure they could manage the risk of component failures.</p> <p>It was also confirmed that in the event of a weather cancellation that the crew remained on the vessel until he end of their shift.</p>
Contingency Plans for breakdowns	Overdue	<p>The breakdowns on the 4th March were a real challenge for the community, leaving many people stranded on the wrong side; workers on the island unable to leave, and islanders who were on the mainland unable to get home.</p> <p><b>Action : Calmac to consider the Colintraive Ferry as an option to be used as the contingency vessel, as it is nearer, and larger capacity than the Tarbert to Lochranza ferry, and the main Bute Service would be unaffected.</b></p> <p><b>Action : Calmac to consider options for a fall-back passenger only contingency if "all else fails" to get people over and back</b></p> <p><b>Not Sending</b></p> <p><b>Acton : Calmac to confirm the number of their staff normally based at Largs who are inducted / able to operate across the 3 vessels typically at Largs for flexible crewing options (No of people who can operate on Loch Shira, Loch Riddon, Catriona) ?</b></p> <p><b>Action : Calmac to also advise on their plans to improve their inductions to improve flexibility across the vessels normally operating from Largs</b></p>
MV Loch Dunvegan	New	<p><b>Action : Calmac to consider with CMAL the option for the MV Loch Dunvegan to be modified to permanently provide the 2nd vessel service from Cumbrae from Summer 2023, by modifying her ramps etc to be more suitable for the Largs Cumbrae Route.</b></p>
Cancellations due to weather & opportunities to sail with improving weather conditions	Closed	<p>The group raised the issue of weather related cancellations for extended periods of time with little or no effort made to sail during improving weather windows. Dario, Calmac Marine Manager, advised that the forecast is continually monitored and any opportunities to sail are taken. The group strongly disagreed with this, prime example being when it was advised on the 16th Feb that sailings for the morning of 17th Feb were cancelled. The weather had abated significantly, however sailings did not resume until 0915.</p> <p>Action : Calmac to review within their Marine Team the recent performance of the timings around the effectiveness of using weather windows to remobilise the sailings.</p> <p><b>Calmac Confirmed that their staffs performance was performance managed to ensure consistency of performance, and that Skippers had been instructed to more frequently review the forecasts.</b></p>
Ar Turas new ticketing system	Open	<p>Calmac advised no indication could be given as to when the new ticketing system was likely to go ahead, but that a formal date was likely to be issued my the Transport Minister within the next few weeks. It was confirmed that books of tickets would now be available for the full summer timetable.</p> <p><b>Action : Calmac to advise of the prospective date for Ar Turas go live date.</b></p> <p><b>Ongoing action : Calmac to advise on the communication plan and the process to be applied on Day 1 of Ar Turas go live, to avoid islanders being disadvantaged by not having a ticket to leave the island.</b></p>
Summer 2022 Ticketing	New	<p>Calmac to consider alternative options to prevent the significant issues associated with queuing by means of a better ticketing process for summer 2022,</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a.Kiosk or mobile ticketing in the car queue or</li> <li>b.an early deployment of their new ticketing system for Cumbrae as a trial or</li> <li>c.some interim online ticket purchase option for the Cumbrae route</li> </ol>
Priority Boarding for the Cumbrae route	New	<p>Concerns highlighted by a passenger who was going to a cancer treatment appointment and had asked for priority boarding. the call centre had said that this wasn't available.</p> <p><b>Action : Calmac to re-brief their call centre staff to remind them that this facility remains in place.</b></p>

Issue / Agenda Item	Status	Action / Comment
Loch Riddon Return to Largs	Noted	Calmac confirmed that once the Lochinvar completes her drydock at Troon within the next few days that the Loch Riddon will return to Largs. This is weather dependant, but should be within the next week
3rd vessel availability for Summer 22 TT	New	<b>Action : Calmac to investigate the availability of the spare Clyde vessel in the summer time (Loch Linnhe ?) as a 3rd vessel to support peak period e.g. Bank Holiday Weekends</b>
Quality and consistency of text messaging. Learnings from the 4th and 5th March	Overdue	Concerns that the quality of messaging isn't as consistent as would be expected. The 4th March technical issue had poor communication and left people very frustrated, as the crewing hours issues must have been known prior to despatching the vessel. The communications on the 5th March, which had a 3hr break in the afternoon, weren't communicated until after 11am, and many customers didn't know that they couldn't get back off the island during the afternoon. <b>Action : Calmac to review how the communications plan was implemented on the 4th and 5th March dealing with the crew constraints and vessels and advise on how they will improve in future</b>
Transport Minister Meeting	New	Transport Minister Meeting arranged by Lisa Christie from Cumbrae Community council for 1st June at 3pm. Prospective attendees from Calmac could be Robbie Drummond and Tommy Gore, and Ramsey Muirhead (Piers) and Jim Anderson (Fleet) from CMAL. <b>Action : Cumbrae Ferry Committee / Community Council to agree a tight agenda to ensure value can be obtained from meeting</b>
Strategic Islands Connectivity Transport Plan	New	<b>Action : Cumbrae Ferry Committee / Community council should feeds its requirements for an strategic change into the current national consultation around Islands Connectivity</b>
Project Neptune	Noted	Consultants reviewing the structure of ferry management in Scotland considering options around the arrangements of Transport Scotland CMAL and Calmac. Due to report to Scottish Ministers shortly
Norwegian Ferries	Noted	Norway are moving to Electric ferries so are there options to buy any of their diesel / electric tonnage for utilisation in Scotland. Calmac confirmed that shallow draft and sea category are the main challenges for 2nd hand tonnage in the world market
Toilet Facilities	Open	Calmac confirmed that they were willing to contribute towards the Cumbrae Slip Toilets used by their shore staff <b>Action : CCDC / Calmac to discuss the funding details</b>
Season Tickets / Carnet of 200 or 300 Tickets	New	<b>Action : Calmac to consider the option of a 200-400 ticket carnet that could be used to replace the season ticket if transport Scotland were to agree to it</b>
AOB	Open	Calmac confirmed that season tickets would still be available for the monthly passes until Arturas is implemented.
Date of next meeting	Noted	Monday 16th April @ 1730. tbc whether face to face or Online